Counseling Rubric
A. Program Mission Statement

Narrative Criteria

The Program Mission Statement
- clearly states the purpose of the program
- indicates the primary function
- indicates the activities of the program
- describes the programs' aspirational goals for the future and what the program hopes to achieve
- reflects the program's priorities and values
- indicates who the students and/or stakeholders are
- is aligned to the college mission statement
- is clear and concise

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: The mission statement meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. Overall, its contents emphasize the unique role and contributions of the unit, complementary of the college identity by aligning its function with the college mission statement.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: Readers could not determine if the unit's mission statement was prepared before or after board approval of the updated college mission statement. Noticeably, the unit has this principle in their mission statement: *We value the worth and dignity of each individual as they positively contribute to their communities and global society.*

B. Counseling Student Contacts

4. What do you observe in the data? What do you want the college to understand about your program and the data?

Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

5. Describe the proposed actions or next steps to maintain or improve the data by student group.

Narrative Criteria

- Actions are informed by data
- Actions are within department control
- Actions are demonstrable (what are the deliverables)
- Outcomes are measurable
- Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for student contacts meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. This means the data underscore strategies the unit will use to: "[provide] academic, career, transfer, personal counseling and instruction." Given the mission statement, these datasets are sensible elements and foundational themes to collect, monitor, and

analyze. The various service modalities and interventions offered by the unit is a commendable and equity-ensuring approach necessary for narrowing the accessibility gap for student success.

Observations

O1: Although the modality differentiation avoids putting unequal burdens on some students in accessing counseling services, the readers are concerned that as demand pressures drive more students to seek Quick Questions (QQs), this trend could undermine the intent of QQs to then be seen as an alternate replacement for appointments. Readers suggest an informed and practical consideration be given to this concern when designing for the future needs of students and response to state mandates. One approach is to efficiently leverage technology for more routine counseling requests.

O2: In-Person counseling modality has significantly declined over the five-year reporting period. Readers recommend the unit construct an intervention to increase receptivity among students for in-person appointments. Readers are concerned about those students without the viable skills to navigate the college system and its processes. Equally important is for the unit to find out, through a data exercise, what is driving less in-person contact in proportion to other types of service modalities.

O3: A distinct component of counseling services is the formation of Student Education Plans (SEP), a deliverable often viewed as a way to support credential attainment. It is critical and central for the unit to adequately identify and respond to the creation of both abbreviated and comprehensive SEP. Adding this metric to their program review makes clearer the outcomes of student contacts regardless of the type of service modality.

O4: Readers agree with the assumption, the stakes are becoming increasingly high with the number of state mandates impacting counseling services. To that end, more state mandates require counseling-backed interventions, notably are AB 928 and 132. The acknowledgement that many more bills will become mandates to improve the student experience and graduation outcomes. That said, equitable access to counseling services must be attained through iteration. One possible iteration is to design a more universally accessible way for students to collaborate in accessing counseling services.

C. Student Contact by Student Demographic

7. What do you observe in the data? What do you want the college to understand about your program and the data?

Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

8. Describe the proposed actions or next steps to maintain or improve the data by student group.

Narrative Criteria

- Actions are informed by data
- Actions are within department control
- Actions are demonstrable (what are the deliverables)
- Outcomes are measurable
- Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for student contact by student demographic meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. The data presented represents the principles outlined in the mission statement. The data establishes what the unit need to find out to: "…empower students in their educational journey by building upon their diverse strengths." To that extent, these datasets are the beginning markers for who is accessing counseling services. The various service

modalities and interventions offered by the unit is a commendable and equity-ensuring approach necessary for narrowing the accessibility gap for student success.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: There is no distinct difference between the majority-minority student groups accessing counseling services over the five-year reporting period. However, what stands out is exploring ways for the unit to increase the overall number of students served in-person.

O2: Historically, in-person appointments were highly sought after, until the pandemic happened. But the readers would like the unit to place more emphasis on the proportion (ratio, percentage) of in-person service modality compared to the other modality types. Readers believe and agree there is a sense of a growing need for in-person appointments but the unit has been unable to fulfill those requests. Capturing the amount of time allotted for in-person appointments compared to other service modalities provides the relational consideration critical to situate the issue of insufficient staffing level.

O3: The readers do not know the rate of receptivity among the different racialized groups in accessing the different service modalities. How each ethnic group accesses counseling services is not obvious but it is a valuable data point. This level of awareness could highlight modalities that inherently produce disproportionate impact. Knowing this information more directly links the mission statement to equitable practices already exercised by the unit.

O4: Not so obvious is the rate of student contact by gender, but it relates to the national conversation. Readers recommend the unit consistently monitor the number of male student contacts, and quickly implement an intervention when contact number dips lower than anticipated. Such quick reaction requires preparation and agreement on appropriate steps to take.

D. Navigating Entry & Course Selection

10. What do you observe in the data? What do you want the college to understand about your program and the data?

Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

11. Describe the proposed actions or next steps to maintain or improve the data by student group.

Narrative Criteria

- Actions are informed by data
- Actions are within department control
- Actions are demonstrable (what are the deliverables)
- Outcomes are measurable
- Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for navigating entry and course selection meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. Both data and narratives give readers clearer information on how New Student Orientation (NSO) addresses critical topics related to helping students navigate the path to college. Readers agree with the unit that periodically updating the modules is a principled part of ensuring content relevancy and accuracy.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: The unit presented results in a clear way but done without discussing what those results and findings might mean, or where they might lead in terms of future student learning, behaviors and insights. Readers believe that is the true intentions of New Student Orientation NSO). The unit can strive for adherence to this type of precision (or similar) and greater rigor that more definitively produces competency-based learning outcomes.

O2: Readers are interested in when students participate in NSO. National trends show that a sizable number of community college students wait until the last minute to enroll in college. Presenting this data based on a completion dates could give the unit more information to determine if differentiation of information is needed for a diverse student population.

O3: Readers could benefit from seeing the actual numbers associated with the percentages found in the table.

E. Understanding Degreeworks

13. What do you observe in the data? What do you want the college to understand about your program and the data?

Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

14. Describe the proposed actions or next steps to maintain or improve the data by student group.

Narrative Criteria

- Actions are informed by data
- Actions are within department control
- Actions are demonstrable (what are the deliverables)
- Outcomes are measurable
- Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for understanding Degree Works meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. The intent of orientation information clearly gives students foundational information critical to helping them understand and engage in academic and educational planning, a significant component and knowledge of the matriculation process that prepares students to meet with a counselor. Readers express sincere appreciation for the unit designing an intervention to enhance student engagement and knowledge with institutional resources before a need arises.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: Readers could benefit from the number of comprehensive and abbreviated ed plans completed each year in relation to the number of students served, including a dataset by race and ethnicity.

O2: Readers could benefit from seeing the actual numbers associated with the percentages found in the table.

F. Articulation

16. What do you observe in the data? What do you want the college to understand about your program and the data?

Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data

- is within the control of the program

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

17. Describe the proposed actions or next steps to maintain or improve the data by student group.

Narrative Criteria

- Actions are informed by data
- Actions are within department control
- Actions are demonstrable (what are the deliverables)
- Outcomes are measurable
- Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for Articulation unit meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. The data provides support for the unit and transfer services relied on by faculty, staff and students. Readers commend articulation officer for continuing to be well informed and well connected, finding ways to access resources and personnel while maintaining the skills and competencies to successfully execute responsibilities.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: Readers are concerned that one position is dedicated to doing the required work of the college. The work required at this level receives occasional assistance, leaving the individual to successfully perform the work by exercising professional judgement and initiative. Readers agree with the unit leader, another position is warranted to safeguard the integrity of the articulation work.

O2: The five-year reporting period shows ebbs and flows with submission and approval rates. Even though the last year indicate an upswing in approvals, which is commendable, readers are not certain how sustainable this climb is given the number of upcoming state mandates, other circumstances, and college-wide decisions that directly impact this unit. To that end, more mandates usually means more reports that this unit will support.

O3: Readers can help but to think that the rate of approvals are directly tied to the support faculty receive from the articulation officer. That said, serving as a faculty liaison comes with an amount of time that might be interrupted or negotiated for a lesser amount given competing tasks. The readers recommends articulation officer leverage technology to offset time spent on routine requests, redesign more intuitive resources and processes for faculty.

O4: The readers were curious if the articulation officer has an idea of where faculty pain points are in the submission process. If that information is available, presenting it in this process can give readers a broader understanding of what challenges exist and perhaps how they form.

G. Service Area Objective Addendum

1. What are the service area outcomes & strategic objectives for the coming year?

Narrative Criteria

- Outcomes/objectives are informed by data
- Outcomes/objectives are within department control
- Outcomes/objectives are demonstrable/actionable
- Outcomes/objectives are measurable
- Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

2. What is your implementation plan for the above-mentioned objectives?

Narrative Criteria

- Actions are informed by data
- Actions are within department control
- Actions are demonstrable
- Outcomes are measurable
- Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for Service Area Objective (SAO) meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. The three SAOs indicate an attempt to expand and strengthen counseling services. Readers applaud the unit for being fully aware of growth opportunities that align with equitable practices and interventions. Such that the modes of service delivery and types of interventions expressed are proactive instead of reactionary.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: Readers could benefit from knowing the number of workshops the unit intend to offer to allied health departments.

O2: Collectively, the SAOs will address a major concern, offer more in-person counseling services. Readers recommend gauging its effectiveness and document resources expended.

H. Enrollment Trends

Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

Data

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

Narrative Criteria

The narrative responses (FTES, Sections, & Productivity)...
- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

☑ Meets Expectations

☐ Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for enrollment trends meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. Course enrollment remains stable despite the pandemic, great effort by unit. Their flexibility in implementing equitable practices and interventions for minoritized students is noteworthy.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: Readers agree with adding another Puente cohort, reflective of the needs and level of responsiveness exhibited by the Latinx student population.

O2: Readers recommend unit take the lead in facilitating campus-wide discussions to garner support and provide feedback to leaders for adding another Puente cohort. Doing so, positions the unit as an authority in establishing where progress has been made and where progress is needed.

O3: Offering to increase the sections of CNSL 5 on campus is a visionary solution but readers are concerned that the current counseling capacity is sufficient. The unit might consider both constraints and opportunities to implement such a bold move. Having those difficult conversations and commitments upfront are bureaucratic barriers that often dictate how bold moves can be realistically achieved.

O4: In addition to partnering with Institutional Research to understand enrollment trends, readers offer doing the same for instructors assigned to the classes. Looking further into who teaches those classes might offer a more informed perspective.

I. Enrollment by Student Demographics

Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

Data

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Narrative Criteria

The narrative responses (Gender and Ethnicity)...
- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for enrollment by student demographics meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. Course enrollment remains stable despite the pandemic, great effort by the unit. Their focus on implementing equitable practices and interventions for the success of minoritized students is noteworthy.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: Understanding the predictors of both course success and course failure rates are vital to how allocation of resources are made. This approach could help the unit determine whether the college view their courses as marginal or central to student success.

O2: Evidence is absent to the unit demonstrating a commitment to universally integrating the Office of Retention Services and embedding Foothill Connect in its efforts, to offset course failure rates the readers highly encourage both.

O3: Differentiate data between dual enrollment and the general student population, it might inform conversations enabling deliberate interventions based on varying needs and available resources. For dual enrollment classes, faculty could benefit from periodically having a discussion with the Outreach team responsible for the dual enrollment program.

J. Overall Student Course Success

Narrative Criteria

The narrative responses (Overall Student Course Success)...
- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for overall student course success meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. Course success remains consistently above average when compared to the general class offering despite the pandemic, another reason to commend the unit. Their focus on implementing equitable practices and interventions for the success of minoritized students is noteworthy.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: The course success rates for Black, Latinx, and Filipinx students in particular is cause for concern. Over the five-year reporting period no significant gains were made. Readers recommend a deeper analysis to uncover why this exists and if gender gaps among these groups inherently exists. By doing so this will highlight where success lies among gender groups especially when done by disaggregating data between dual enrollment and the general student population.

O2: Absent from the reflection is a plan for how to access data knowingly a little more difficult to come by. Because this type of data tends not to be routinely collected by the college and do not integrate well with other sources of data.

K. Course Success by Modality

Click the link below to view the program's Course Success by Modality data

https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/10771097_fhda_edu/EvAWlA883IZEvnoRGBXt4RkBzT8NbCHSRANRq3TVkHj_TA?e=LjaKXc

Narrative Criteria

The narrative responses (Course Success by Modality)...
- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for course success by modality meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. Course success differentiated by modality remains comparable to the general class offering. The unit focus on key aspects of the data by course type and modality is appreciated.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: Consider investigating the modality in which the courses are offered. Readers believe online classes exacerbate the achievement gap between racialized student groups.

O2: FoQuestion 20 from the template is thoughtfully fielded. In addition to group meetings to discuss pedagogy, the unit should use the Office of Online Learning as a resource for helping to improve success rates for online classes. Consider inviting colleagues from online learning to several of their meetings when discussing pedagogy.

O3: For Question 21 from the template, readers suggest the use of self-made videos as a terrific way to make online courses more engaging. For these self-made videos, make them interactive by inserting quiz questions. Here are tutorials for how to create, edit, caption, and insert quiz questions into videos.

How to record and edit videos in Studio (3:30 min)

[How to create captions and insert videos into your course (2:00 min)](#)

[How to create quizzes directly in your Studio videos (4:00 min)](#)

L. Disproportionate Impact

Click the link below to view the program's Disproportionate Impact data

https://foothilldeanza-
my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/10771097_fhda_edu/EvAWlA883IZEvnoRGBXt4RkBzT8NbCHSRANRq3TVkHj_TA?
e=LjaKXc

Narrative Criteria

The narrative responses (Disproportionate Impact)...
- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Feedback

M. Regular and Substantive Interaction

Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...
- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Feedback

Strength: Data for disproportionate by modality meets the evaluation criteria outlined above.

OBSERVATIONS

O1: Online learning has produced a document outlining various practices related to regular and substantive interaction in online classes. It would be helpful to review the document to understand practices related to regular and substantive interaction.

https://foothillcollege.instructure.com/courses/2488/pages/suggested-practices-for-regular-and-substantive-
interaction?module_item_id=2175501

N. Summative Evaluation

Overall, the Comprehensive Program Review

☑   Meets Expectations

☐   Needs Improvement

Feedback

The data summative evaluation meets the evaluation criteria outlined above. The unit wrote a great deal about its ability to influence independent learning and development among students receptive to their services and support. They cited more attention will be given the certain student groups and issues of course success rates – for good reason. Additionally, the readers are mindful that certain datasets do not commonly exist but pursuing its

formulation could help clarify certain student behaviors while more accurately informing the creation of interventions. There is indication that combined the commitment of counselors and their work are having a positive impact felt across the campus among students, faculty, staff, programs and participatory governance.

The issue of counseling availability suggests the unit is a high-need area sought after by students and college-wide efforts even though their capacity continues to be limited by these competing demands. Results and findings of this review suggest that the unit cannot be defined by only traditional measures of success, doing so works against their multiple identities as a unit. Readers found the unit relies on both informal and formal networks to pursue service excellence. Facilitating the use of this full range of network available and diversity of work on campus often not associated with traditional sources of counseling responsibilities, such adoption takes on even greater significance to the unit.

Yet it is clearer that the unit will experience more change at a faster rate. The reality, however, is that the counselors work in a diverse environment will require the college to build greater institutional capacity as time goes on. The future will require the unit and college to be more articulate about what counseling services will look like for the next generation of students.

This form is completed and ready for acceptance.